

The Mystery of the Rosary Cantorales: A Study in Attribution

LORENZO CANDELARIA

In 1989 Yale University acquired from a Connecticut book dealer an impressive manuscript that has since been identified by nothing other than its call number, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Ms 710.¹ Initially, the size of this manuscript is its most striking feature. It measures an extraordinary 96 x 62 cm and contains 103 folios of vellum, each of which required the use of a full calfskin. The opening folios (fig. 1 and 2; the illustrations are found on the accompanying CD) are magnificently decorated with a large illuminated letter featuring the Virgin and Child, splendid marginalia depicting the Labors of Hercules, and a border painting (fig. 3) modeled after Albrecht Dürer's engraving, *Das Meerwunder*. The model engraving is datable to 1498 and provides a useful *terminus post quem* for the compilation of Beinecke Ms 710.² This accords well with other features, such as script and the overall style of decoration, which reflect a date of production near the turn of the sixteenth century.

The large codex is mostly made up of all the chants necessary for singing the Ordinary of the Mass. Thus it is a liturgical choir book, one generally referred to as a Kyriale. Beinecke Ms 710 also transmits a polyphonic work of special interest: a four-part *Et incarnatus est* from a Credo attributed to "Josquin." It is, in fact, from the *Missa sine nomine* by Josquin Desprez. However fragmentary a portion of the complete Mass, this "new" Josquin source provides the fifth known manuscript concordance for the *Missa sine nomine*, and is at present the only Josquin Mass material preserved in an American library.³

A formidable and sumptuously decorated volume, the Beinecke Kyriale has rarely failed to engage the attention of anyone who sees it. For well over a decade specialists in a variety of fields including codicology, art history, and musicology have attempted to discover something about its provenance with little success. To some it has seemed Flemish, to others Italian. The book dealer from whom it was purchased in 1989 was himself unsure of its origins. His description notes only that the choir book was said to have come from Switzerland.⁴

The Kyriale is in fact Spanish. Several features might have suggested this immediately were it not that Spanish chant sources beyond the medieval period have generally received little attention from scholars. The very size of this manuscript might have been noticed as an obvious starting point. While large choir books can be found in other regions, it is mostly among Spanish sources that we find such enormous tomes of almost exaggerated proportions. Indeed, this Kyriale comes across as a fairly modest example when we consider the sizes of over two hundred chant books now at the former Hieronymite monastery of El Escorial, near Madrid. Each of the Escorial's chant books measures what must be a record 108 x 75 cm, and comes mounted on four small wheels along the lower edge to make it somewhat easier to manage.⁵

Another distinctive feature is the use of a five-line staff instead of the more common four-line staff for the notation of plainchant. The five-line staff is occasionally found in northern Italy, but this, again, is a predominantly Spanish feature. Furthermore, the curious text division found in words such as "a-lme" (as opposed to "al-me"), and in many other places where a consonant is separated from a vowel it would normally accompany in non-Spanish sources, might have provided a clue. Andrew Hughes observed this peculiar manner of text underlay while working with Catalan liturgical manuscripts,⁶ and it is one I have encountered frequently in Castilian chant sources as well.

While carefully studying each folio in the Beinecke Kyriale I found more secure evidence to bolster these general observations on a Spanish provenance. First, there is the use of a corrector's mark often found in Iberian sources. Initially, it closely resembles a percentage sign (%), but it is actually the word *ojo* (Spanish for "eye"), an appropriate directive to indicate that attention is warranted. Of course, one might expect to find this sign in Latin American manuscripts as well. More certain are two geographical references that became visible in the underlayer of a palimpsest with the help of ultraviolet light: "...ta in illustra receptit hyspaniam [v.] Hoc matutino sidere claro fulgas hyspania lumine" (responsory in the underlayer of a palimpsest. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms. 710, fol. 103v).

The two references to Spain, *hyspaniam* and *hyspania*, are obviously most consequential. But the nature of this chant is also suggestive. Its overall form and content—the indication for a verse, the reciting tone, and particularly the reference to the "morning star" (*Hoc matutino sidere*)—suggest that it is responsory for Matins. Furthermore, the inclusion of extra-liturgical references, such as "*hyspania*," may well indicate that what we have here is an example of a *verbeta*, a special trope found in medieval Spanish books for the morning hours.⁷

All evidence to this point indicates that the Beinecke Kyriale presents a good example of a Spanish chantbook from the early sixteenth century, a good example of what Spaniards call a cantoral. This term is generally used to distinguish plainchant volumes like Ms 710 from *libros de coro* ("books of the choir"). The latter term indicates a large manuscript codex, consisting mostly of polyphonic music, that is usually liturgical.

Once assured of its Spanish origin my next question was: where exactly in Spain did this cantoral come from? That question directed me initially to two distinctive features in the illumination. One was the large initial inhabited by the "Virgin and Child" plus two men, one kneeling, the other standing. The second was the device of the Five Wounds on a white cloth, displayed very much like a heraldic emblem in the borders. Each device is inscribed along the bottom with the words *Miserere mei* in gold paint. My interest grew as I learned of five other leaves sharing precisely these two characteristics (table 1). One is also at Yale's Beinecke Library, catalogued there as Ms 794. Others are preserved at the Pierpont Morgan Library in New York, the Detroit Public Library, and the Getty Museum in Los Angeles. The fifth leaf appeared recently in an exhibition by the antiquarian dealers Bruce Ferrini and Jörn Günther. The Morgan leaf is of particular interest since, like Beinecke Ms 710, it too depicts Hercules in its marginal decoration.

TABLE 1

BEINECKE MS 710 AND FIVE RELATED LEAVES

New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Ms. 710
Kyriale. 103 folios

Illumination: Initial "R" with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); border painting after Albrecht Dürer's *Das Meerwunder* (1498); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription "Miserere mei"

1. Detroit, Detroit Public Library, Burton Historical Collection

Gradual leaf

Incipit: *Nos autem gloriari*

Liturgical Use: Introit for Solemn Evening Mass on Maundy Thursday

- Illustration: Initial “N” with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription “Miserere mei”
2. Los Angeles, J. Paul Getty Museum, Ms. 61
 Gradual leaf
 Incipit: *Judica me deus et discerne*
 Liturgical Use: Introit for Mass on First Sunday of the Passion
 Illustration: Initial “J” with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblem with Five Wounds and inscription “Misere mei” (sic)
 3. New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Ms. 794
 Palimpsest. Gradual leaf (originally from an Antiphoner)
 Incipit: *Intret in conspectu tuo*. Originally *Sacerdos et pontifex*
 Liturgical Use: Introit for a Mass of Two or More Martyrs out of Paschal time. Originally antiphon preceding the Magnificat.
 Illustration: Initial “S” with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription “Miserere mei”
 4. New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, M. 887–1
 Gradual leaf
 Incipit: *Ad te levavi animam meam*
 Liturgical Use: Introit for First Sunday in Advent
 Illustration: Initial “A” with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblems with Five Wounds and inscription “Miserere mei”
 5. Jörn Günther and Bruce P. Ferrini, *Overlooking the Ages: A Private Exhibition of Illuminated Manuscripts, Miniatures and Printed Books* (Hamburg, 1999), cat. no. 28.
 Gradual leaf
 Incipit: *Quasi modo geniti infantes*
 Liturgical Use: Introit for Mass on Low Sunday
 Illustration: Initial “Q” with the Madonna and Child (*El Cavaller de Colunya*); emblem with Five Wounds and inscription “Miserere mei”

As I worked through acquisitions records pertaining to every leaf in a public collection I was astonished to find that none had ever been traced to its original owner. Indeed, the mystery surrounding the Beinecke Kyriale at Yale actually began as early as 1958. That was the year the Pierpont Morgan purchased the related leaf that has since remained unattributed.⁸

Taken as a whole, the distinctive iconography shared by these separate folios with the Beinecke Kyriale reveals that none was an isolated product. Together they must have formed part of a set commissioned by the same person or institution. Judging from the most basic materials for their production—vellum, gold, rich pigments, and, not least, labor—it is clear that these deluxe cantorales reflect patronage stemming from extraordinary wealth. An individual patron is strongly suggested by the kneeling figure in the initial; indeed, the prominent display of the initial itself suggested a donor portrait. Upon closer inspection it becomes clear that more is here than first meets the eye. Notice in the detail from the Beinecke Kyriale (fig. 4) that the man kneeling on the left with his hands clasped in prayer wears a floral crown. Furthermore, the Virgin and Child have each in hand a single flower. Another man stands to the right of the enthroned Virgin, and judging from his clothing, helmet, and sword, he is some type of soldier. Every leaf in the related manuscript complex shares these characteristics.

As it turns out, the subject of this illumination is not a donor portrait at all. It depicts a legend of

the rosary known in Spain since the late fifteenth century as *El Cavaller de Colunya*, “The Knight of Cologne.”⁹ Spaniards regarded this as a miracle tied to the famous rosary confraternity established at Cologne in 1475. The Cologne brotherhood enjoyed an enormous popularity. By 1482 it claimed to have enrolled over 100,000 members, and, among these, none could have been more prestigious than Emperor Frederick III. Owing in no small part to the emperor’s celebrity and the well-publicized sanction of Pope Sixtus IV, the rosary brotherhood of Cologne quickly extended its influence throughout Western Europe.¹⁰

The earliest written account of the “Knight of Cologne” in Spain dates from 1535. It is found in a tract printed for a Valencian rosary confraternity that survives in only one exemplar at the Biblioteca Colombina in Seville.¹¹ Briefly, the legend tells the story of a man who, having slain a friend in a quarrel, was beset by the victim’s brother, a knight who sought to avenge the death. This knight eventually came upon the killer praying before an altar of the Virgin, but as he moved to strike down his sworn enemy, he noticed that the Mother of God stood before him, weaving a natural rosary from the roses that came out of the killer’s mouth while he prayed. When the rose garland was finished, the knight saw that the Virgin placed it upon the killer’s head and forgave him for his most grievous crime. Overcome by this miraculous vision, the brother was deterred from seeking his revenge. The men proceeded to pray the rosary together, then parted as good friends.¹²

The image in the illuminations thus celebrates not only a miracle of the rosary but also an ideal of *fraternitas*. Not only is a killer absolved of a grievous crime, but he and the bereaved brother part as good friends!—all through the agency of a prayer that ensures Mary’s intercession in time of need, a prayer, moreover, whose simplicity is one of its chief virtues. Then, as now, the basic form of the rosary was fifty *Ave Marias* or “Hail Marys” divided into decades by five *Pater nosters* or “Our Fathers.”¹³

While the Valencian tract of 1535 preserves the first extant written account, an engraving by Francisco Domènech for a rosary confraternity in Barcelona demonstrates local knowledge of the miracle in 1488, almost fifty years earlier. One of the sections in that engraving clearly depicts the protagonist of the story kneeling by the Virgin, wearing a crown of roses, and with three roses issuing from his mouth. The vengeful brother is also depicted (this time with a band of accomplices) raising a dagger to strike his brother’s killer. An inscription above the compartment identifies the scene as *miraculum militum*—“the miracle of the soldiers.”¹⁴

To follow up on the “Knight of Cologne” legend, I worked through seminal documents tied to the Cologne brotherhood only to find nothing of the tale. Pursuing other leads I found that the “Knight of Cologne” is actually a late fifteenth-century Spanish adaptation of a story that had circulated widely in German, Latin, French, and even Ethiopian and Arabic sources dating back to the thirteenth century. The story usually involves a monk or a merchant and a band of thieves in the woods, and can be found in the sermons of Saint Vincent Ferrer, as well as in a medieval French miracle play titled *De un Marchant et un Larron*. An early musical rendering of the basic plot is among the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* attributed to Alfonso the Wise.¹⁵

What emerges from the Cologne documents, moreover, sheds an interesting light on the emblem of the Five Wounds that bears the inscription *Miserere mei* (fig. 5). Traditionally, the emblem of the Five Wounds is connected with the Franciscan Order in Spain, as well as in Latin America; it is a reference to the five stigmata that famously marked the founder of the Order, Saint Francis of Assisi. But the Five Wounds were also important in the cult of the rosary, which

was propagated primarily by the Dominican Order. As it turns out, so was the penitential fiftieth Psalm of David (Vulgate numbering), which begins “Have mercy on me Lord,” or, in Latin, *Miserere mei Deus*.

Perhaps the two most important printed documents emanating from the Cologne rosary confraternity in the year after its founding were Jakob Sprenger’s statutes for the brotherhood, and a scholarly defense of the rosary by Michael Franciscus de Insulis, a Dominican professor of theology at the University of Cologne.¹⁶ Relying heavily on number symbolism to help promote the rosary, Sprenger advanced a mystical union between the five “Our Fathers” of the prayer and the Five Wounds of Christ. Likewise, Insulis compared the redemptive power of the fifty “Hail Marys” to that of the highly revered fiftieth Psalm, the penitential *Miserere mei*.¹⁷ In my broad survey of documents tied to Spanish rosary confraternities, I found not only an intimate familiarity with the seminal Cologne texts, but that Sprenger and Insulis were cited with particular frequency by Spanish Dominicans.¹⁸

The inscribed emblem of the Five Wounds in the Beinecke Kyriale and its sister leaves is thus a concise statement reflecting the essential mysticism and redemptive power of the rosary. In borrowing from the symbolic language of the earliest documents emanating from Sprenger and his Cologne circle, the emblem pays homage to that important rosary brotherhood in a way that is consistent with the illumination depicting the “Knight of Cologne.” While in our day we may question the veracity of the legend, its profound significance to at least one rosary confraternity from early Renaissance Spain, the brotherhood connected in some way to the chantbooks that I have since come to designate as the “Rosary Cantorales,” is beyond doubt.

That most of the chant books in this related complex have survived as leaves that, without regard to their artistic value, are essentially fragments, reflects a situation common in the study of manuscript sources. The largely intact Kyriale, Beinecke Ms 710, however, provides a substantial body of material for analysis. As the most complete exemplar of the “Rosary Cantorales,” this Kyriale also offers the greatest potential for discovering something about the provenance of these manuscripts. A close study of its physical characteristics yields proof of a Spanish origin. Its illumination suggests ties to a rosary confraternity. To refine the search further, I turned to its texts and music.

In terms of content, Beinecke Ms 710 is most unusual in that its chants are richly ornamented by tropes. Tropes are broadly understood to be textual and/or musical additions to chants of the Mass; troping flourished from the ninth to twelfth centuries but gradually fell out of fashion.¹⁹ They are thus distinctly late-medieval creations, and are rarely found after 1400. Yet the Beinecke Kyriale transmits no fewer than twenty-one tropes for the Mass Ordinary: thirteen for the Kyrie, one for the Gloria, four for the Sanctus, and three for the Agnus Dei (table 2).²⁰

TABLE 2. TROPES FOR THE ORDINARY IN BEINECKE MS 710

Kyrie

- Rex virginum amator (fol. 1v)
- Cunctipotens genitor deus (fol. 3v)
- Summe deus (fol. 5)
- Rector cosmi pie (fol. 7)
- Pater excelsa mariam (fol. 9)
- Kyrie fons bonitatis (fol. 11)
- Kyrie cunctipotens domine (fol. 13)

Rex magne domine (fol. 15)
Kyrie summe rex (fol. 17v)
O pater immense dux noster (fol. 20)
Iesu redemptor omnium (fol. 22)
Xpriste patris genite (fol. 24v)
Xpriste deus decus (fol. 27)
Gloria
Spiritus et alme (fol. 30v)
Sanctus (Osanna)
Clangat cetus iste letus (fol. 50)
Celeste preconium (fol. 53)
Osanna salvifica [...] rex angelorum (fol. 78)
Clangat hodie vox [fragment] (fol. 81)
Agnus Dei
O Iesu salvator (fol. 81)
Crimina tollis (fol. 82v)
Ave maria celi regina (fol. 83)

Presented with an unattributed troped Kyriale, one may fruitfully consult some basic bibliographical tools to help determine the geographical distribution of texts and melodies through concordant sources. Toward that end, compilations such as *Analecta Hymnica*, *Repertorium hymnologicum*, and the indices of chant published by students of Bruno Stamblein are of invaluable service.²¹ Spanish medievalists may turn to the chant and trope compilations of Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta and Eva Castro Caridad.²² These are fundamental sources for musical-liturgical research. In this case, however, my efforts were initially hampered by the simple fact that Spanish chant and liturgy from the sixteenth century onward remain largely unstudied by musicologists.²³

The magnitude of this void in music history became especially clear as I worked through sources at a number of ecclesiastical institutions and research libraries in Spain, searching for chants that were concordant with those in the Beinecke Kyriale. In the course of eighteen months I was astonished to find several collections of late chant cantorales that in many cases had been placed in storage and forgotten: 114 at the Cathedral of Cordoba, 48 at the Biblioteca de Catalunya in Barcelona, 33 at the Cathedral of Ávila; and in New York City I found 87 at the Hispanic Society of America. Untold troves surely await discovery elsewhere.

Even with the small number of chants I was able to study in a relatively short time, a much more defined picture came into view regarding the provenance of the Beinecke Kyriale. I found that the Kyriale transmits two especially rare items that had not been previously identified, in Spain or elsewhere. One is a trope for the Sanctus that I was able to recover from an erasure on fol. 78r-79v:

Osanna salvifica [...] rex angelorum
Spes [...] [...] salus perfectorum
In huius solennio de sudantem chorum
Clementer constitue sub spe salvandorum
Errantes retifica rectos fac constantes
Huius sancti precibus salvate laudantes

In mundi naufragio rege navigantes
Ne mergantur fluctibus te glorificantes
In excelsis.

The other item is a chant for the Gloria that appears on a later insertion (fol. 54r–55v).²⁴ It is preceded by a sign for *tempus imperfectum*. Thus, the chant is mensural and would have been performed in a moderate duple meter (inserted Gloria “de Apostoles,” ca. 1600. New Haven, Beinecke Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Yale University. Ms, 710, fol. 54r–55v). Overall, this melody reflects many characteristics of late Spanish chant. In addition to being mensural, it is also much more diatonic than older chants tend to be, with a marked bent toward melodic minor. The scalar melody with its occasional wide leaps is more idiomatic of keyboard music than the voice, suggesting it might represent some internal line of a polyphonic Gloria for the organ. Stylistically, it seems to have been composed near the turn of the seventeenth century.

Instances such as these of “new” tropes and melodies for the Ordinary serve well to illustrate our imperfect understanding of Spanish chant and liturgy during and after the Renaissance. For the question of attribution, however, the most useful examples are those with known concordances, and particularly those that are rare and limited in the geographical extent of their circulation. As signposts pointing toward specific musical-liturgical practices, these carry a potential for tracing more precisely the origins of this or any other unattributed liturgical manuscript with music.

TABLE 3. SPANISH TROPES AND MELODIES IN BEINECKE MS. 710

1. Fol. 9 [Kyrie]

Pater excelse mariam preparans eleyson
Iesu benigne mariam consecrans eleyson
Spiritus alme mariam obumbrans
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas cantandum in festivitibus sanctorum per annum secundum consuetudinem romane curie: atque etiam de novo additis juxta usum sancte granatensis ecclesie* (fol. 9) [TOLEDO]

2. Fol. 13 [Kyrie]

Kyrie cunctipotens domine miserator eleyson
Xpiste verbum caro factum de virgine eleyson
Kyrie te celebrantibus una in te sperantibus eleyson
12 c. Montserrat, Biblioteca del Monasterio, Ms. 73 (fol. 7v) [MONTSERRAT]
13 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 35-10 (fol. 117v) [TOLEDO]
14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 180v) [TOLEDO]
1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 198v) [TOLEDO]

3. Fol. 17v [Kyrie]

Kyrie summe rex glorie sideream regens arcem potenter eleyson
Criste veteris macule purgator ade verbi gena eleyson
Kyrie sancte spiritus vivifice aspirans supplici tue promptus familie eleyson
12 c. Salamanca, Biblioteca Universitaria, Ms. 2637 (fol. 266v) [SILOS?]
13 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 35-10 (fol. 177v) [TOLEDO]
14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 181v) [TOLEDO]

4. Fol. 20 [Kyrie]

O pater immense dux noster mitissime eleyson.

Xpriste deus verbum patris qui mundi reatus clementer pertulisti eleyson
O paraclite alme ab utroque spiritus lux prefulgens procedens eterne nosterque consolator
eleyson.

1539 Seville, *Manuale chori romanum noviter compilatum super omnia alia
completissimum* (fol. 194v) [SEVILLE]

1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 100) [TOLEDO]

5. Fol. 24v [Kyrie]

Xpriste patris genite tocius gloria vite eleyson

Dextra paterna ream revoca miserando choream eleyson

Amborum flamen confer de more juvamen eleyson

14 c. Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, M. 1361 (fol. 182v) [TOLEDO]

15 c. Toledo, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 52-14 (fol. 38v) [TOLEDO]

16 c. Santo Domingo de Silos, Biblioteca del Monasterio, s.n. (fol. 60v) [SILOS]

6. Fol. 77 [Sanctus]

Melodic fragment.

1544 Granada, *Officia ad missas* (fol. 214v) [TOLEDO]

7. Fol. 79v [Sanctus]

Melody designated “De Angeles”

1707 Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, Ms. 18724/51 (“Ordo Missae del Misal Mixto
Mozarabe”) [copied in TOLEDO]

1789 Madrid, *Manual Procesional para el uso de la provincia de San Joseph de
Franciscos Descalzos en Castilla la Nueva* [MADRID]

8. Fol. 82 [Agnus Dei]

O Iesu salvator dulcis consolator tua nobis dona expectata bona

O pacis amator o bonorum dator tua nobis dona expectata bona

De supernis vite nobis dona mitte sicut permisisti quando recessisti

14 c. Burgos, Monasterio de las Huelgas, s.n. (fol. 18) [BURGOS]

9. Fol. 83 [Agnus Dei]

Ave maria celi regina domini mei mater alma

13 c. Tortosa, Biblioteca Capitular, Ms. 135 (fol. 35) [TORTOSA]

14 c. Barcelona, Biblioteca del Orfeò Català, Ms. 1 (fol. 9) [TARRAGONA]

In that respect nine chants have been especially useful. These are listed in table 3 along with the provenance of each as reflected by the source. None is found outside of Spanish sources. With the exception of two Agnus Dei chants concentrated in Burgos, Tortosa, and Tarragona, this collection largely reflects the use of Toledo. My designation of the *Officia ad missas* (Granada, 1544) as Toledan reflects the fact that the liturgical practices of Toledo were implemented in Granada immediately following the Spanish conquest of this last Muslim stronghold on the Iberian Peninsula in 1492.²⁵ Indeed, the *Officia ad missas* commemorates that very occasion with a frontispiece depicting the surrender of Granada by Sultan Boabdil (Abu ‘abd Allah Muhammad XI) to King Fernando, Queen Isabella, and the powerful Toledan Cardinal Pedro González de Mendoza (prelacy 1482–95).

With my attention particularly focused on Toledo, I soon came upon another discovery of import. In my codicological study of the Beinecke Kyriale, I frequently came across two very peculiar types of folded notes with tails—one with two tails pointing up, the other with two tails pointing down—that are not typical in square chant notation. An example appears above the word “vir-gin-um” in figure 1, although the tails pointing upward are scarcely visible in the

illustration. These distinctive note shapes are frequent in Toledan sources dating from the fifteenth through the eighteenth century, and were subsequently explained in an anonymous sixteenth-century chant treatise now at the Biblioteca de Catalunya (Ms 1325). The treatise referred to them as *tocus* and *uncus*, and placed them among eight principal figures used for ornamenting plainchant in Toledo: “*Tocus* is a figure resembling a breve with two plicas upward, and it was invented to signal that the voice should be repelled upward and then return to the same point in the place of the melody. *Uncus* is a figure like a breve with two plicas downward, and it was invented to repel the voice downward, then return to the same point.”²⁶ Essentially, these ornaments represent what we would call double grace notes today. The anonymous theorist records that the ornaments were collectively referred to as *estrunto* in Toledo, a word undoubtedly related to the modern Castilian *estrucendo*, meaning a big noise or disruption.²⁷

Interestingly enough, while concordances for rare items in Beinecke Ms 710 pointed generally to the use of Toledo, the more intimate bond with the city of Toledo itself was reflected by the uncommon ornamental tones in many of the chants in this Kyriale. Later, I was pleased to learn of corroborating evidence in ornamentation of another kind. The Hercules iconography appearing in the marginalia of the Beinecke Kyriale and the related Morgan leaf had not been the mere whim of an illuminator. Indeed, from at least the mid-fourteenth century Hercules was believed not only to have founded Toledo but to have lived there in an enchanted cave. To this day residents of the city take special pleasure in pointing out the legendary *Cueva de Hercules* near the site formerly occupied by the church of San Ginés, destroyed in 1840. It was only recently identified as the ruin of an elaborate Roman aqueduct system that channeled water from the Tagus River into the center of town.²⁸

Convinced at that point of a Toledan origin and some connection with a rosary confraternity, I narrowed my search to five Dominican houses in the province of Toledo. (In Spain, and elsewhere, rosary confraternities were tied almost exclusively to the Dominican Order.) Based on their foundation dates, four could be ruled out, as the two earliest among them were established in 1527, about a quarter of a century too late for the *cantoriales*.²⁹ The only viable candidate was the Dominican monastery of San Pedro Mártir de Toledo, founded in 1407.³⁰ As the only Dominican monastery within the medieval city walls, San Pedro Mártir looked especially promising. But did it have any connection with a rosary confraternity?

Working through local histories, chronicles of the Dominican Order, and documents at the diocesan archive of Toledo, I was able to confirm not only that it did, but that the rosary confraternity tied to San Pedro Mártir was one of extraordinary fame and wealth in its time. While exceptions were made for the richest noblemen of the city, official statutes limited membership to those in the silk weaving trade; this was a lucrative industry, and a cornerstone of the Toledan economy from the last quarter of the fifteenth century. The rosary brotherhood of silk weavers kept a substantial treasury at San Pedro Mártir. Surviving account books reflect that the confraternity generously endowed the monastery with funds to sustain monthly rosary Masses which were often preceded by grand processions that included music and fireworks. Other gifts of note were expensive altarpieces, silk draperies for the cloisters, as well as an elaborate throne and ornate dresses for a beloved image of the Virgin in their rosary chapel.³¹

The monastery of San Pedro Mártir is an awe-inspiring sight in and of itself. Although it began as a modest cobbling of houses in 1407, by the middle of the eighteenth century it boasted a surface area rivaling even the great cathedral of Toledo. At its peak it measured over twenty

thousand square meters (sixty-six thousand square feet) and included two conventual churches and four cloisters.³² Judging from surviving double choir stalls that accommodated 122 Dominican friars, Masses celebrated at San Pedro Mártir must have been every bit as grand as the convent itself. Had the “Rosary Cantorales” been the liturgical instruments used in those surely magnificent celebrations?

The circumstances would appear to answer that question in the affirmative. But the end to any good mystery always requires a “smoking gun”—in this case, a cantoral of similar design that has survived at the monastery. I was assured, however, that none would be found there. Between 1835 and 1837, decrees of exclaustation issued under the governmental reforms of Juan Álvarez Mendizábal led to the dissolution of virtually every religious house in Spain, including San Pedro Mártir de Toledo.³³ Only four religious communities were left intact, one of them housed at the monastery of Santo Domingo in Ocaña, a small town not far from Toledo.³⁴

On paying a visit to Santo Domingo, I learned from one of the brothers, Friar Jesús Santos (who served as the archivist), that following the dissolution of San Pedro Mártir on 28 January 1836 the Dominican monastery of Ocaña assumed ownership of a complete set of cantorales that had belonged to the Dominicans of Toledo. All of them dated from the sixteenth century, and they remained at Santo Domingo de Ocaña until the Spanish Civil War of the 1930s, when they disappeared without anyone knowing where they had gone.³⁵

Toward the end of our visit, Friar Santos brought out an envelope containing large calligraphic letters that he claimed had been cut out of those manuscripts. Upon seeing them I was immediately struck by their similarity in overall design and ornament to those in the Beinecke Kyriale, right down to the penwork flourishes. When I examined the fragments more closely I realized that Friar Santos had given me the “smoking gun” I was looking for. Several of these letters were inscribed with incipits to the rosary’s fundamental prayer: *Ave maria gratia plena*, “Hail Mary full of Grace” (figs. 6 & 7). In the absence of identifying emblems and illuminations, there could be no stronger indication than these prayer incipits that the Toledan confraternity had indeed some connection to these *cantorales*.

The case was thus put to rest. Considered from the various disciplinary perspectives of codicology, art history, liturgics, popular religion, and, of course, musicology, the assembled body of evidence firmly placed original ownership of the “Rosary Cantorales” with the Dominican monastery of San Pedro Mártir in Toledo. But as I reflected on my journey to that conclusion, I realize that while uncovering the origin of these deluxe manuscripts was of some import, a much broader significance resided (and continues to reside) in their role as remarkable cultural artifacts, witnesses to the largely unstudied musical, artistic, and religious cultures of early Renaissance Spain.³⁶

ENDNOTES

1. “Recent Acquisitions Briefly Noted. The Witten Purchase,” *The Yale University Library Gazette* 64/3-4 (April 1990): 176–90.
2. The image and its cultural significance are examined in Lorenzo Candelaria, “Hercules and Albrecht Dürer’s *Das Meerwunder* in a Chantbook from Renaissance Spain,” *Renaissance Quarterly* 58/1 (2005): 1–44.

3. The fragment is discussed in Peter Urquhart, "An Accidental Flat in Josquin's *Sine Nomine* Mass," in *From Ciconia to Sweelinck: Donum natalicium Willem Elders*, ed. Albert Clement and Eric Jas (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1994), 125–44.
4. Correspondence regarding the unknown provenance of Ms 710 is on file at the Beinecke Library, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut.
5. See the descriptions in Vicente Rabanal, *Los cantorales de El Escorial* (El Escorial: Imp. del Monasterio de El Escorial, 1947), and Samuel Rubio, *Las melodías gregorianas de los "libros corales" del monasterio del Escorial: estudio crítico* (El Escorial, 1982). This impressive collection still awaits a comprehensive study. I am grateful to Friar Jafet Ortega, O.S.A., for facilitating my access to these manuscripts.
6. Andrew Hughes, "Medieval Liturgical Books in Twenty-Three Spanish Libraries: Provisional Inventories," *Traditio* 38 (1982): 370.
7. See Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta, *Historia de la música española: desde los orígenes hasta el "ars nova"* (Madrid, 1983), 242.
8. See Fredrick B. Adams, Jr., *Ninth Report to the Fellows of the Pierpont Morgan Library, 1958 & 1959* (New York, 1959), 32–4, and correspondence regarding the unknown provenance of M. 887–1 on file at the Pierpont Morgan Library.
9. The legend and its sources are discussed at length in Lorenzo Candelaria, "El Cavaller de Colunya: A Miracle of the Rosary in the Choirbooks of San Pedro Mártir de Toledo," *Viator: Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 35 (2004): 221–64.
10. See Anne Winston-Allen, *Stories of the Rose: The Making of the Rosary in the Middle Ages* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997), 4, 24–5, 66, 116, 127, 137.
11. *Trellat sumariament fet dela bulla, o cofraria del psaltiri o roser* (Valencia, 1535), A4v–A5v. Seville, Biblioteca Colombina, 14–2–7(10).
12. The legend is translated directly from the source in Candelaria, "El Cavaller de Colunya," 234.
13. Each decade is accompanied by a meditation on one of the five joyful, five sorrowful, or five glorious mysteries. In an Apostolic Letter of 16 October 2002 (*Rosarium Virginis Mariae*) Pope John Paul II added an optional five mysteries, the first major change to the rosary in over five hundred years. The "Luminous Mysteries," or "Mysteries of Light," recall five events from the public life of Christ: (1) his baptism in the Jordan; (2) his miracles at the wedding of Cana; (3) his proclamation of the Kingdom of God and call to conversion; (4) his transfiguration; and (5) his institution of the Eucharist as the sacramental expression of the Paschal Mystery.
14. Candelaria, "El Cavaller de Colunya," 229–32, 263.
15. *Ibid.*, 237–45.
16. Jacobus Sprenger, *Erneuerte Rosenkranz-Bruderschaft* (Augsburg, 1476); Michael Franciscus de Insulis, *Determinatio quodlibetalis facta colonie* (Basel, 1476).

17. Sprenger, fol. 3r-v; Insulis, 6v–7r.

18. See for example, Hieronim Taix, O.P., *Libro dela institucio, manera de dir, miracles e indulgencias del roser de la verge Maria señora nuestra* (Barcelona, 1556), fols. 14r, 17r.

19. The scholarly repertory on tropes is extensive and varied. For general discussions see David Hiley, “Tropes,” in *Western Plainchant: A Handbook* (Oxford, 1995), 196–238, and Eva Castro Caridad, *Tropos y troparios hispánicos* (Santiago de Compostela, 1991), 17–58.

20. For a detailed study of these tropes see Lorenzo Candelaria, “Tropes for the Ordinary in a 16th-Century Chantbook from Toledo, Spain,” *Early Music* 34 (2006): 587–611.

21. Clemens Blume and Guido M. Dreves, eds. *Analecta hymnica medii aevi*, vol. 47, *Tropen des Missale im Mittelalter* (Leipzig: O. R. Reisland, 1905); Ulysse Chevalier, *Repertorium hymnologicum: Catalogue des chants, hymnes, proses, séquences, tropes en usage dans l’église latine depuis les origines jusqu’à nos jours*, 6 vols. (Brussels: Société des Bollandists, 1892–1921); Detlev Bosse, *Untersuchung einstimmiger mittelalterlicher Melodien zum “Gloria in excelsis deo,”* Forschungsbeiträge zur Musikwissenschaft, 2 (Regensburg: G. Bosse, 1955); Margareta Melnicki, *Das einstimmige Kyrie des lateinischen Mittelalters*, Forschungsbeiträge zur Musikwissenschaft, 1 (Regensburg: G. Bosse, 1955); Martin Schildbach, *Das einstimmige Agnus Dei und seine handschriftliche Überlieferung vom 10. bis zum 16. Jahrhundert* (Erlangen: Offsetdruck-Fotodruck J. Hogl, 1976); Peter Josef Thannabaur, *Das einstimmige Sanctus der römischen Messe in der handschriftlichen Überlieferung des 11. bis 16. Jahrhunderts*, Erlanger Arbeiten zur Musikwissenschaft, 1 (Munich: W. Ricke, 1962).

22. Ismael Fernández de la Cuesta, *Manuscritos y fuentes musicales en españa: edad media* (Madrid: Alpuerto, D. L., 1980); Castro Caridad, *Tropos y troparios*.

23. Professor Fernández de la Cuesta helped shape the course of my scholarly work with a simple but important question that he posed during my visit to El Real Conservatorio Superior de Música in Madrid: How can we claim to know anything about the celebrated Golden Age polyphony of Spain if we know absolutely nothing of the chant melodies that inspired it? He proceeded to share, with characteristic generosity, an important inventory of printed music books he had published, “Libros de música impressos en España antes de 1900 (II). Siglos XV y XVI,” *Música: Revista del Real Conservatorio Superior de Música* 3 (1996): 10–29.

24. A tab sewn onto fol. 54 designates this as “Gloria de Apostoles.”

25. Francisco Bermudez de Pedrazas, *Historia eclesiastica, principios, y progresos de la ciudad, y religion catolica en Granada* (Granada, 1638), fols. 169v–171r, 172r–173v, describes the surrender of Granada and the subsequent installment of Toledan musical-liturgical practices.

26. “Tocus es figura sicut brevis con dos plicas azia riba, fue inventada en senyal de repelar la voz aza riba y tornar al mesmo puncto en lugar de melodía. Uncus est figura como breve con dos plicas azia baxo, y fue inventada para repelar la voz azia baxo y tornar al mesmo puncto.” Barcelona, Biblioteca de Catalunya, Ms. 1325, fol. 21v. The treatise is available in a modern edition by Karl-Werner Gumpel in “El canto melódico de Toledo: algunas reflexiones sobre su origen y estilo,” *Recerca musicológica* 8 (1988): 38–45.

27. “Y estas dos [tocus and uncus] llaman en Toledo estrunto.” Barcelona, Ms. 1325, fol. 21v.

28. Candelaria, "Hercules and Albrecht Dürer's *Das Meerwunder*," 19–22.
29. The four (and their foundation dates) are: San Jacinto de Madrideojos (1602), San Antonio de Yepes (1587), San Ginés de Talavera de la Reina (1527), and Santo Domingo de Ocaña (1527). Manuel Maria de los Hoyos, *Registro documental, tomo I: material inedito dominicano español* (Madrid: Publisher?, 1961), 67–70.
30. In "El Cavaller de Colunya," 222–24, I present a brief historical overview of the Dominican Order in Toledo, and especially their religious house of San Pedro Mártir.
31. *Ibid.*, 221–22, 245–51.
32. *Ibid.*, 222.
33. See the article "Desamortización" in *Enciclopedia universal ilustrada europeo-americana*, vol. 18 (1915; repr. Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1987), 360–70. The unceremonious exclaustation of San Pedro Mártir is described in Julio Porres Martín-Cleto, *La desamortización del siglo XIX en Toledo* (Toledo: Disputación Provincial, 1965), 429.
34. Friar Manuel González, O.P., of the Convento de San Pedro Mártir in Madrid (there is no connection with the Toledan house), informed me in a personal communication that the four communities that were allowed to remain were the Dominicans of Ocaña, and the Augustinians of Valladolid, Burgos, and Montuedo (Navarra).
35. "En dicho convento había una colección de 'cantorales' del siglo XVI, que después de la 'desamortización de Mendizábal' en 1835, pasaron al convento de Santo Domingo de Ocaña. Aquí estuvieron hasta la pasada Guerra Civil Española (1936–1939) en que desaparecieron sin que sepa a donde fueron a parar." Personal communication from Friar Jesús Santos, O. P. of Santo Domingo de Ocaña.
36. The cultural significance of the Beinecke Kyriale is the subject of my book *The Rosary Cantoral: Ritual and Social Design in a Chantbook from Early Renaissance Toledo*, forthcoming from Boydell & Brewer.

Lorenzo Candelaria is an associate professor of musicology at the Sarah and Ernest Butler School of Music at the University of Texas at Austin. He is a historian of Western European art music in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries with a particular focus on Catholic music in sixteenth-century Spain and its subsequent impact on devotional cultures in Latin America and the southwestern United States. Dr. Candelaria is an accomplished violinist, an active lecturer, and author. His recent books include American Music: A Panorama (with Daniel Kingman) and The Rosary Cantoral: Ritual and Social Design in a Chantbook from Early Renaissance Toledo. He is currently writing a book entitled Music in Mexican Catholicism.